


# PARAMETRIC PIE CHART

When you're making a pie, the crust is a must.

There are millions of pie dough recipes that claim to be “the best.” What’s more surprising is there’s an incredible amount of variation in these recipes, even though pie dough consists of a handful of pantry staples. We took nine recipes from reputable sources, charted out their ingredients, compared their preparation methodologies, and put the baked pie crusts to the test.

	Lee Bros.		Culinary Institute of America		Stella Parks		ChefSteps		King Arthur Baking		Art of the Pie		Fannie Farmer		The Pie and Pastry Bible		Professional Baking	
Defining feature	Buttermilk		3-2-1		Laminated		Ours		Fat blend		Leaf lard		Hot water		Two-stage butter		Shortening	
Mixing method	Hand		Stand mixer		Hand		Stand mixer		Hand		Hand		Hand		Food processor		Hand	
Flour type	AP, bleached		AP		AP, Gold Medal Blue		Bread		AP		AP, unbleached		No specification		Pastry		Pastry	
Ingredients																		
Flour	145	100%	1350	100%	225	100%	250	100%	300	100%	363	100%	215	100%	320	100%	500	100%
Fat	56	38.6%	910	67.4%	225	100%	205	82%	188	62.6%	224	62%	100	46.5%	200	62.5%	350	70%
Water	0	0%	450	33.3%	115	51%	55	22%	100	33%	133	36.6%	85	39.5%	85	26.5%	150	30%
Sugar	0	0%	0	0%	15	6.6%	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%	25	5%
Salt	4	2.7%	30	2.2%	4	1.7%	3	1.2%	5	1.6%	3	0.8%	2	0.9%	1.5	0.5%	10	2%
Special	Buttermilk 96 66.2%												Baking powder 1.5 0.7%		Cider vinegar + baking powder 15.5 4.8%			
																		

Lard *and* butter; needs thorough chilling; uses buttermilk instead of water, which adds a bit of caramelization and changes the way the dough handles; savory and delicious.

With a relatively large proportion of butter, the Culinary Institute of America's pie dough is a dream to handle when raw, and bakes up flaky and just tender enough, although it could use a bit more salt for flavor.

Stella Parks's pie dough recipe for Serious Eats has the highest proportion of butter out of all the recipes, and it makes a resilient, easy-to-handle dough. However, it's formulated to work specifically with Gold Medal Blue Label all-purpose flour.

The ChefSteps pâte brisée is tender, crumbly, flaky, buttery and can be used in sweet and savory applications. It comes together quickly in a stand mixer and is a dream to roll out and work with.

King Arthur Baking's pie dough is well-seasoned, very tasty, and very flaky, thanks to a combo of butter and shortening, but it's a touch difficult to roll out and handle.

The Art of the Pie's pie dough recipe is resilient, wonderful to work with, flavorful, and very flaky. A perfect pie dough.

Fannie Farmer's hot-water pie dough is very stable, but isn't very tender or flaky. Takes a gentle touch to roll out; it's more like a pâte sucrée than a pâte brisée.

The Pie and Pastry Bible's pie dough recipe is almost perfect: very firm, easy to roll out, very tender, but it's a little oily and could be more flavorful.

All-shortening pie dough recipe from Wayne Gisslen's *Professional Baking* is stressful to work with and could use a little help on seasoning.